Educational Patterns of French-Canadians in Holyoke 1868 to 1910*

Peter Haeblter

In the historic 1881 Report of the Massachusetts Bureau of the Statistics of Labor, Carroll Wright expressed the view that French-Canadians

... will not send their children to school if they can help it, but endeavor to crowd them into the mills at the earliest possible age. To do this they deceive about the age of their children with brazen effrontery. They deceive also about their schooling, declaring that they have been to school the legal time, when they know they have not, and do not intend that they shall. And when at length they are cornered by the school officers, and there is no other escape, often they scrabble together what few things they have, and move away to some other place where they are unknown, where they hope by a repetition of the same deceits to escape the schools entirely, and keep the children at work right on in the mills. And when, as is indeed sometimes the case, any of them are so situated that they cannot escape at all, then the stolid indifference of the children wears out the teacher with what seems to be an idle task...²

Carroll Wright's generation was concerned with determining whether the French-Canadians were worthy stock for the American melting pot. The French-Canadians' alleged low regard for education was an important ingredient in the nativist opposition to their migration into New England during the last half of the nineteenth century. However, a closer look at French-Canadian schooling patterns provides valuable clues to the understanding of their acculturation experience. This study of French-Canadian education in Holyoke, Massachusetts, between 1868 and 1910 not only reveals the enrollment trends but also seeks to identify the underlying forces and cultural values which affected French-Canadian families' educational decisions.

*An earlier version of this paper was presented at the annual meeting of the American Historical Association in Washington, D.C., December 28, 1980.
Since the British conquest of Canada, Catholic education had been an integral part of the French-Canadians' effort to maintain their faith and cultural identity. Indeed, the French-Canadian experience as a beleaguered minority in the century following the conquest produced a comprehensive, conservative and nearly inflexible value system. As a result, French-Canadian migrants to the United States possessed a much greater sense of ethnic cohesion than immigrants from most other ethnic groups during this period.\(^3\)

Although no historical synthesis of the French-Canadian experience in New England exists, numerous local studies suggest that the French-Canadians in the small and medium-sized factory towns of central and southern New England achieved a degree of cohesion and stability by the mid-1880s. However, the direction of the development of these French-Canadian communities after 1885 is somewhat contradictory. On one hand, in areas such as labor agitation and politics, French-Canadians appeared to have followed a pattern of union and political activity similar to other ethnic groups. On the other hand, in matters related to religion and language preservation there was considerably greater resistance to change.\(^4\)

The same dichotomy appears in the schooling of French-Canadian children in Holyoke, where the decision of French-Canadian parents was influenced by pragmatic economic considerations, as well as by a desire to provide a French Catholic education for their children. The Holyoke experience suggests that the evolution from ethnic exclusivity to social integration was not a progressive, consistent evolution but rather a change which emerged from a struggle between two sets of values and realities.

Holyoke was a product of the Industrial Revolution. Backed by Boston capital, Holyoke's promoters wished to imitate the success of Lowell, Lawrence, and Chicopee Falls, by making the town a model textile-producing center. While Holyoke's growth was uneven and it eventually became a center for the manufacture of paper products, textile production played an early and continuing role in the town's economy.\(^5\) From its beginnings in the 1840s, Holyoke was a planned industrial town with a high percentage of its population foreign-born. Its early labor needs had been met primarily by native New Englanders and Irish immigrants. As a new town, Holyoke had not yet achieved institutional stability when major French-Canadian migration began after the Civil War. In addition, Holyoke's economic base was considerably wider than other New England cities in which most French-Canadians settled. Unlike many New England textile towns dominated by one or two companies, Holyoke offered a wider range of employment opportunities. Thus, the French-Canadians who came to Holyoke confronted a new town where basic institutions were undergoing rapid change, where a considerable degree of economic diversification had developed and where a social structure within the working class reflected the complex makeup of the city's industry. By 1900 there were approximately 13,000 French-Canadian residents of Holyoke, nearly thirty per cent of the population. However, the Irish remained the
largest ethnic group in the city and smaller colonies of Germans and Poles made up most of the remainder of Holyoke's ethnic community. In 1869, responding to a request from local French-Canadian community leaders, Bishop John Williams of Boston dispatched Father André Benjamin Dufresne to Holyoke to establish a French-speaking parish. Father Dufresne enjoyed considerable initial success in unifying the French-Canadian community and directing their efforts toward the construction of a church. However, by the mid-1870s Father Dufresne had become embroiled in a controversy with a large segment of his congregation. The disputes, centering around issues of ecclesiastical discipline, focused on the role that a French-Canadian curé could play in an American setting. The controversy showed that a significant majority of Holyoke's French-Canadians would not permit their priests to play the dominant role in community life as they had in Canada. Father Dufresne's difficulties were not confined to struggles with his own congregation. His efforts to establish a French-Catholic school in Holyoke brought him into conflict with members of the Protestant elite and their educational beliefs.

French-Canadian schools in Holyoke were used by the family as a bulwark against the forces which threatened their value system. Concerns about the erosion of their religious and ethnic identity had been largely responsible for bringing Father Dufresne to Holyoke. In fact, the request for a priest followed the discovery that some French-Canadian children were taking English instruction at a local Protestant church and that many, without the presence of a French-Canadian priest, were marrying outside the Church. The French-Canadian parish, Precious Blood (Precieux Sang), did not establish a parish school until 1876. Father Dufresne's first seven years in Holyoke were principally devoted to organizing the parish and constructing a church. In 1875 a disastrous fire in the original church left more than ninety dead and severely taxed the resources of the parish. The opening of a school the following year in the basement of the uncompleted new church suggests that Catholic education enjoyed a high priority within the French-Canadian community and that its establishment could not be further delayed. The school began with 70 students, and was staffed by two lay teachers who provided all the instruction in French.

French-Canadians' enthusiasm for education was not completely self-generated. Massachusetts pioneered in compulsory school attendance and a number of laws were passed that limited the ages and conditions of work for children. In the 1870s the General Court enacted a series of measures concerning public education which were to directly affect the French-Canadians in Holyoke. In general, these laws required longer periods of schooling for children who worked in factories and mercantile establishments.

The opening of the Precious Blood school touched off a debate on assimilation, and led to an extended dispute between Father Dufresne and local school officials. An 1876 Massachusetts law required children under 14 years of age to provide evidence of having had twenty weeks of
Father Andre B. Dufresne, illustration from the Golden Jubilee of the Parish (1919).
schooling prior to employment each year. Local school committees were authorized to issue certificates of attendance only if the schools met with their approval and satisfied the requirements of the law. When schools reopened in September 1876, the Holyoke School Committee established a committee to examine the private schools in the city. The special committee consisted of three members of the school committee, including Moses M. Mitivier, a French-Canadian. In 1874, Dr. Mitivier, a proponent of public education with anti-clerical sentiments, had been elected to the school committee for a three-year term. The chairman of the special committee submitted a report which stated that the French-Canadian school conformed to the law and should be recognized. A minority report was also offered. The author of this second report was not identified, but there is little doubt that it was Dr. Mitivier. The dissenting opinion pointed out that the French-Canadian school, which had over 200 pupils, employed only two female teachers, one of whom could not speak English. It was argued that two teachers could not properly handle that number of children and that since English was not taught, the school did not conform to existing law. The full committee, perhaps sensing that they were dealing with a potentially volatile issue, tabled the matter for the rest of the school year.

In 1877, another special committee, which included Dr. Mitivier, was appointed to examine the French-Canadian school. This committee attempted in vain to visit the school in an official capacity. While Father Dufresne asked for public financial assistance for the parochial school, he at the same time made it clear that he would in no way relinquish any control, and the matter was further exacerbated by personal animosity between the priest and Mitivier. The School Committee, faced with Dufresne’s intransigence, had little choice but to accept the recommendation of the special committee to refuse to approve the school for the purpose of issuing work certificates. This stalemate would continue until 1882.

For the next four years, the enrollment at Precious Blood school ranged from 100 to 200 pupils. The parish history maintains that Father Dufresne accepted only those students who would follow the thirty-eight-week course—significantly longer than the 20 weeks required by the public schools for work certificates. Evidently, most French-Canadian parents who were given a choice of a French Catholic education for their children or the opportunity to have them employed for half the year by sending them to public school chose the latter. Given the crowded conditions at Precious Blood school, many parents perhaps thought the public schools offered a better education. In addition, the attendance figures suggest that most of the students in the French-Canadian school might have been from families whose income did not require their children to work.

Father Dufresne realized that the enrollment of the parish school could not be substantially increased unless the impasse with the school committee was resolved. The fire of 1875 necessitated that the new church be completed as quickly as possible and Dufresne directed his energies and the resources of the parish to that end. Not until 1881 was he able to turn his
full attention to the school. Then he invited the Canadian Order of Grey Nuns to take control of education in Precious Blood parish; soon after the nuns' arrival enrollment dramatically increased. Three hundred students began the 1881 fall term and by the end of that year, 600 were attending. Father Dufresne also began plans for a school building which was completed in 1883.18

The Holyoke School Committee, of which Dr. Mitivier was no longer a member, was quick to conclude that the presence of a teaching order of nuns was sufficient reason to approve the school. Accordingly, such recognition was granted in February, 1882. However, there is considerable doubt as to whether the school was in compliance with an 1878 Massachusetts law which required that classes be conducted in English. By all accounts, much attention was given to the study of the French language, and to Canadian and Church history. The Grey Nuns, who had been educated in Canada, were unfamiliar with United States History, and thus the students likely learned little of the history of their new homeland. When the Grey Nuns were replaced in 1887 one of the reasons given was that little, if any, instruction at the school was in English. Moreover, the rules governing the Grey Nuns restricted them to the teaching of girls. Father Dufresne had made plans for a school for boys shortly before his death, but there are indications that boys had been attending Precious Blood. However, their number and the manner of their instruction is unclear.
Neither is it certain that the school retained its thirty-eight week attendance policy.  

By the mid-1880s, a French Canadian Catholic school was solidly entrenched in Holyoke. In 1884, one-quarter to one-third of the French-Canadian children aged 5 to 15 attended Precious Blood, although many of them also worked part of the year. The school was yet another symbol of the strength of Holyoke’s French-Canadian community and served to transmit and strengthen French-Canadian and Catholic values. However, the emphasis on the education of females in the years before 1887 indicates that these values reflected the view of the family that Catholic education be provided first to the future wives and mothers who would be the purveyors of the French-Canadian cultural heritage.

Most of the French-Canadian children who did not receive a parochial education attended the city’s public schools. There are some indications that the state law concerning school attendance was modified in Holyoke to conform to local sentiment. Manufacturers were quite aware of the value of French-Canadian labor and favored the establishment of French-Canadian institutions in Holyoke as a means of ensuring a cheap and stable work force. One can only infer pressure from employers, but certainly the policy of school officials usually worked to the manufacturers’ advantage. As early as 1877 there were charges that the Superintendent of Schools had permitted children under 14 to work without school certification for reasons of hardship but in violation of the law. Also, state investigators discovered a number of children who had been hired without the proper papers. In his 1880 report, the Superintendent candidly admitted that he had approved work certificates for children who came directly from Canada:

Many of the school certificates, although issuing from French Canadian schools to pupils not knowing a word of English, were nevertheless received by me whenever I found the pupils able to read and write any language. The influx from the northern border comes in families, only the younger members of which enter the schools, *nolens volens* [whether willing or unwilling].

If Holyoke officials were inclined to be flexible in their enforcement of the school laws, there were other factors which contributed, however unwittingly, to greater French-Canadian school attendance. In 1879, the Massachusetts General Court authorized the use of state police detectives to act as factory inspectors and commissioned them to look for violations in the employment of women and children. The inspectors, despite their small number, succeeded so well that some employers asked for relaxation of the laws. Manufacturers were required to retain a file of school certificates for each employee under 14; and administrative costs, plus increasingly severe penalties for violation, led many factories to reduce or eliminate their younger workers. Initial enforcement of the twenty week law in Holyoke benefited from a surplus labor market and most employers
appeared willing to discharge the children in favor of older workers. In a related matter, the City Council in 1882 appointed an assistant truant officer who was French-Canadian. In subsequent years, this post was always filled by a French-Canadian who was active in the French-Canadian districts. The enforcement of factory laws and school attendance laws did not end the practice of child labor, but it did insure that most children received some schooling.23

French-Canadians presented special problems for school authorities. Officials proceeded from the assumption that French-Canadian parents were more anxious to have their children work in the mills than attend school, and certainly there were attempts by French-Canadian parents in Holyoke to misrepresent the ages of their children in order to obtain work certificates. Soon the Superintendent of Schools adopted a policy of requiring birth or baptismal records as proof of age, although in the case of new arrivals, a temporary work certificate was usually issued even if the child could not offer proof of school attendance in Canada. If evidence was not forthcoming, the truant officer was dispatched to insure that the child received the twenty weeks of required schooling.24 The periodic influx of large numbers of French-Canadians into Holyoke seriously taxed the capacity of the schools in the French-Canadian areas. For example, in 1879, one room at the Chestnut Street school had 80 pupils, all but six of whom were French-Canadians. Such unusual circumstances were only temporary, however, and school officials were quite flexible about closing and opening rooms as circumstances required.25

During the 1880s, the truant officer’s census indicated that about 75 per cent of the city’s children between the ages of 5 and 15 attended school at least part of the year. After 1881 it is likely that nearly one-half of the French-Canadian children spent at least part of the year in the public schools. Dissatisfaction with Father Dufresne or cost factors might have influenced some parents not to send their children to Precious Blood, but a more likely explanation, given the large number of French-Canadian children who were employed, is that public schools, which met for three separate ten week sessions, provided longer periods for the children to work.26 A further indication of the economic position of Holyoke’s French-Canadians is the almost total absence of French-Canadian names in the high school rolls. Sons, and occasionally daughters, of prominent French-Canadians were sent to Canada either for all of their education or for a college degree, but the majority of French-Canadians left school permanently as soon as the law allowed.27

By the mid-1880s, a substantial number of Holyoke’s French-Canadians were receiving a public education, although the quality of this education is difficult to determine. While French-Canadian teachers were not hired by the city until a later period, some public school teachers did have proficiency in the French language. Clearly, French-Canadians in the public schools were exposed, to some degree, to the values and ideas of their adopted country. French-Canadians also participated in considerable
numbers in the public evening school. The Holyoke School Committee had created an evening school in 1870 and French-Canadians were hired as instructors and administrators. Naturalization clubs and French-Canadian social-fraternal groups had urged French-Canadians to attend and to learn English, but the efforts were sporadic and the results mixed. In 1887, the General Court passed a statute which made employers liable for a fine for any minor employee who could not read or write English and who was not attending school. Enrollment in the evening school immediately skyrocketed. In October of 1887, some 1500 persons were in attendance, the majority of whom were French-Canadian. Since the average age of these students was eighteen years, the state law appears to have been the force which motivated their attendance.  

In 1887, Dufresne's successor, Father Herman Landry, replaced the French-speaking Grey Nuns with bi-lingual teachers from the Order of St. Anne. While this action was important to French-Canadian acculturation and to community acceptance of the parochial school, it had little impact on school attendance. Enrollment at Precious Blood had been rising since the Grey Nuns arrived in 1882 and the new teachers neither hindered nor stimulated this trend. In the decade following the approval of Precious Blood school by the Holyoke School Committee, the French Catholic school educated, on the average, 35 to 40 per cent of the French-Canadian children in the city.

A dramatic change occurred in 1892 when the newly created Perpetual Help Church opened its parish school. A sharp rise in the total number of children attending French-Canadian parochial schools indicates that many parents desired a French Catholic education for their children and that either the lack of space at Precious Blood or geographic considerations had made this education impossible before 1892. From that time until 1904, more than half of the city's French-Canadian children attended one of the two parish schools. Although the School Department did not record the ethnic background of students after 1904, the French Catholic school attendance figures kept pace with the growth of the total school population. The opening of a third parish school, Immaculate Conception, in 1906, did not result in any sudden rise in French-Canadian enrollment. Rather, the figures indicate that this new school drew children from Perpetual Help, the parish which had been divided to create Immaculate Conception.

The French-Canadian parochial schools served as a means of transmitting French-Canadian cultural values and religious practices. In 1889 when the Superintendent of Schools and a delegation from the Holyoke School Committee visited Precious Blood School, they noted that the children under seven years of age, i.e., those not legally required to attend school, were taught entirely in French. The older pupils were taught mainly in English and the Superintendent was favorably impressed with the operation of the school. When Perpetual Help School had opened some School Committee members had been concerned that too much of the teaching was conducted in French, but a visit by the School Committee
resolved the issue to everyone’s satisfaction.\textsuperscript{30}

The French-Canadian clergy continued to insist that all their parishioners send their children to the parochial school, and in 1890 Father Landry delivered a sermon which, attacking the public school system, claimed that the pupils learned little and that neither French nor English was taught well.\textsuperscript{32} At this time, the fee for students at Precious Blood was fifty cents per pupil per month, a sum within reach of all but the poorest families, and judging by attendance figures, many low and moderate income families thought a French Catholic education worth the cost.\textsuperscript{32} In general, the relationship between the Church and public school officials after 1890 was much more harmonious than it had been during Father Dufresne’s tenure. When a new school building was opened at Precious Blood in 1894, the pastor, Father Charles Crevier, invited the School Committee to inspect it; this was the first time that the School Committee had been extended such an offer by Church authorities and the visit was described as “a happy exchange of courtesies.”\textsuperscript{33}

During the 1880s and 1890s a series of state laws helped to encourage French-Canadian parents to send their children to the parish schools. These laws mandated long periods of compulsory school attendance and thus offset any economic advantage that had been previously gained by public school attendance. The minimum age permitted for work in factories or mercantile establishments, which had been ten years in the 1880s, was raised in stages to fourteen years by 1898. Similarly, annual compulsory school attendance was increased to eight months during the same period. There were still problems enforcing state laws, but if the annual reports of Holyoke’s truant officers are accurate, most of the children attended school the prescribed length of time.\textsuperscript{34} The number of work certificates issued by the Superintendent of Schools each year showed an erratic pattern, but by 1910 the number stood at 344, half what it had been three decades earlier; moreover, since 1898 these work certificates were issued only to those fifteen and sixteen year olds who were not required to attend school. Thus, with opportunities for child labor cut off for most families and with a French Catholic school in each of the three French-Canadian neighborhoods in the city, parents continued to choose these schools for their children.

Public school attendance had become increasingly unattractive for French-Canadians. The attendance patterns of the mid-1880s had been reversed in less than a decade. Before 1882 approximately half the French-Canadian children had gone to the public schools and only one-third had attended Precious Blood. From 1882 to 1910, 50 to 60 per cent of the French-Canadian students went to one of the three French Catholic schools, while only one-fourth to one-third received a public education. Moreover, from 1882 onward, there was usually only one French-Canadian representative on the School Committee and there is little evidence that this presence was valued by the French-Canadian community. Significantly there were no French-Canadian teachers in the grammar schools until the mid 1890s and then only a few were hired; the first French-Canadian was
not hired at the high school until 1904.  

Whether French-Canadian youth attended public or parochial schools, the majority ended their formal education when they became fifteen years old. While high school attendance was not high among the population at large, French-Canadians appear to have attended in disproportionately low numbers. In 1909 only four of 105, and in 1910, eight of 118 Holyoke High School graduates were French-Canadian; the French Catholic parishes did not develop programs for older students until the 1920s. As in the earlier period, some wealthier French-Canadian families sent their children to Canada for preparatory and college education, and St. Cesaire's College, in Quebec appears to have been a favorite for Holyoke residents. Holyoke boasted at least thirty St. Cesaire graduates, many of whom were active in promoting their alma mater. In 1907 alone, twenty Holyoke residents were enrolled there. A handful of French-Canadian students continued their education in the United States, attending schools which included Holy Cross, Amherst, and Mount Holyoke, or pursuing commercial or professional study.

After the early 1890s, more than half of Holyoke's French-Canadian children attended French Catholic Schools. Originally established to transmit French-Canadian traditions, history, and religious practices, they were significantly transformed by their American setting; if only because Massachusetts law and the realities of life in Holyoke demanded that students receive a substantial part of their instruction in English. Thus, perhaps ironically, as the parochial schools strengthened the transplanted French-Canadians' ethnic identity, they also provided the language skill which ultimately eased their students' integration into the larger Holyoke community. Primarily reflecting the decision of French-Canadian families to ensure their children a French-Catholic education, the growth of these schools reveals both the emerging economic stability of Holyoke's French Canadians and their conscious decision to resist the inexorable pressures for acculturation.

NOTES

1. Before 1900, most French-speaking emigrés from Quebec referred to themselves as "French-Canadians," "Canadians," or "French"—appellations which helped them define their place in American society. Only in the first decade of the twentieth century did the term "Franco-Americans" find acceptance, providing another indication of the French-Canadians' self-concept and heralding a new phase of their history in the United States.


8. *Holyoke Transcript*, February 27, 1869.


13. Mitivier was something of a rebel and his political career can most charitably be described as erratic. Unlike most French-Canadians of this period, Mitivier was an admirer of the public school system and opposed the establishment of parochial schools.

14. The Holyoke School Committee Minutes, located in the office of the Superintendent of Schools, are quite terse and do not elaborate on this or any other matter.

15. Holyoke School Committee Minutes, September 5, 1876 and October 26, 1876; Alexandre Belisle, *Histoire de la presse franco-americaine et des Canadiens-francais aux Etats-Unis* (Worcester, 1911), p. 181; *Springfield Republican*, September 7 and 30, 1876; *Transcript*, September 9, 1876.


28

21. Pursuant to an 1876 law, the city truant officer prepared a semi-annual census of children between the ages of five and fifteen. As helpful as these statistics are, they can only provide general impressions of French-Canadian school attendance. Massachusetts, Acts, 1876 Chapter 52 and 1878, Chapter 257; Holyoke School Committee, Annual Report (1877-1886).

22. Holyoke School Committee, Annual Report (1880), p. 29; “Canadians in Holyoke,” p. 5; Green, Holyoke, p. 301; Republican, September 1, 1877, November 2, 1877.

23. Massachusetts, Acts, 1879, Chapter 305; Ensign, Compulsory School Attendance, pp. 65, 67; Transcript, September 9 and 16, 1876; Republican, September 11, 1876, December 26, 1879, October 13 and 18, 1882.

24. Transcript, January 1, 1881; Republican, February 20, 1879, April 18, 1879, September 20, 1880, July 22, 1886.

25. Transcript, June 18, 1879, January 1, 1881.


27. Transcript, February 12, 1884, September 1, 1884, January 5, 1885.

28. Holyoke, Town Report (1870), p. 29; Massachusetts, Acts, 1887, Chapter 433; Springfield Democrat, October 13 and 19, 1883; Republican, February 4, 1886, November 2, 1886, October 6, 16, 19, 20 and 25, 1887; Transcript, November 5, 1885, October 3, 1887, September 28, 1888, October 9, 1888, October 12, 1889.


30. Transcript, March 28, 1889, April 5, 1892.

31. Ibid, January 14 and 20, 1894. The incident caused a minor furore in the parish. Father Landry went to the Transcript and demanded to know who provided the newspaper with information about the sermon. The editor refused to provide the name and Landry denounced the paper and called upon French-Canadians to boycott it. However, at a meeting attended by 1000 French-Canadians, the general sentiment was that such an action against the Transcript was ridiculous and those who rose in defense of Landry were shouted down. Landry was apparently no more successful than Dufresne had been in controlling matters that were outside his religious province.

32. Ibid, January 14, 1890.

33. Ibid, November 8, 1894.

34. Holyoke, Superintendent of Schools, Annual Report (1880-1910); Massachusetts, Acts, 1883, Chapter 224, 1888, Chapter 348, 1890, Chapter 384, 1898, Chapter 496.


36. “Canadians in Holyoke,” p. 8; Transcript, September 4 and 9, 1884, January 5, 1885, August 24, 1886, March 9, 1894, September 5, 1899, March 18, 1907, August 28, 1907, June 24, 1909, June 23, 1910.